

# Q&A Cheat Sheet

Q1. What is the Gemara's question?

*A1. Why are you teaching me 2 things?*

Q2. What in the Mishnah prompted the Gemara's question?

*A2. You taught me 2 things; teach me 1 and I'll infer the other from it*

Q3. How does the Gemara's answer address the Gemara's question?

*A3. Refutes Hava Amina (premise) that there are 2 teachings*

Q4. What in the Mishnah prompted the Gemara's answer?

*A4. The 4 claims were made by the same 2 people.*

Q5. How does Rav Pappa or others answer the Gemara's question?

*A5. (See last Rashi on .ג)*

# Notes

## Prat u'Klal:

Prat (specific): אני מצאתיה

Klal (general): כולה שלי

Klal should incl. Prat

## Hava Amina Illustration:

Q: Why are you rushing for the train on a Sunday?

A: *What are you talking about? It's Monday, I'm late for work!*

Question refuted by knocking out Hava Amina

## Hava Amina for Gemara's Question:

Mishna	Claim 1	Claim 2
Teaching 1	Person A: אני מצאתיה	Person B: אני מצאתיה
Teaching 2	Person C: כולה שלי	Person D: כולה שלי

## Gemara's Answer knocks out Hava Amina:

Mishna	Claim 1	Claim 2
Teaching 1	Person A: אני מצאתיה וכולה שלי	Person B: אני מצאתיה וכולה שלי

The Gemara later reinstates the Hava Amina.

# Notes

## Rashi bottom of ב.

במקח וממכר - קנייתיה מיד פלוני ודוקא מקח וממכר הוא דאמרינן יחלוקו בשבועה  
דאיכא למימר שניהם קנאוה ולשניהם נתרצה המוכר אבל זה אומר אני ארגתיה וזה  
אומר אני ארגתיה לא יחלוקו דודאי חד מינייהו רמאי הוא ותהא מונחת עד שיבא  
אליהו

About buying and selling: I bought it from the hands of x. And it is only about buying and selling that we say [that] they divide [it] with an oath. For it is possible to say [that] both of them bought it and that the seller agreed to both of them. But [if] this one said, "I wove it," they would not divide it; for one of them would certainly be a swindler. So it would remain in place until Eliyahu comes.